

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1

The Structure of Environmental Enforcement

§ 1.01	Introduction	1-2
§ 1.02	Absence of a Comprehensive Approach	1-3
§ 1.03	The EPA’s Enforcement Structure	1-6
	[1] Historical Underpinnings: From Fragmentation to “De-Balkanization”	1-6
	[2] EPA’s Present Enforcement Structures	1-7
	[3] Consolidated Approach to Enforcement: Multimedia	1-8
	[4] EPA’s Trial Attorneys—The Department of Justice	1-11
§ 1.04	The Federal/State Relationship	1-13
	[1] Overview	1-13
	[2] The Delegation Process	1-13
	[3] Parallel Proceedings, Overfiling, and Judicial Abstention	1-17
	[a] Parallel Proceedings	1-17
	[b] Overfiling	1-17
	[c] Abstention	1-26
	[4] Double Jeopardy	1-28
§ 1.05	The Government’s Pre-Litigation Enforcement Authority	1-31
§ 1.05A	Agency Decisions and Rule Making	1-34
	[1] The Administrative Record	1-35
	[2] Threshold Barriers to Review	1-42
	[a] Standing	1-42
	[i] Procedural Aspects of Standing	1-42
	[ii] Proof of Standing	1-43
	[iii] Organizational Standing	1-43
	[iv] Standing in Climate Change Cases	1-44

ENVIRONMENTAL ENFORCEMENT

	[b] Exhaustion	1-45
	[c] Ripeness	1-46
	[3] The Final Agency Action Requirement	1-48
	[4] Judicial Deference to Agency Action	1-51
§ 1.06	Citizen Suits	1-57
§ 1.07	The Criminalization of Environmental Enforcement	1-60
§ 1.08	The Politics of Environmental Enforcement	1-62
	[1] Generally	1-62
	[2] The Novel Coronavirus: A Case Study	1-62
§ 1.09	Conclusion	1-65

CHAPTER 2**The Statutory Power to Investigate**

§ 2.01	Overview	2-2
	[1] Administrative Subpoenas and Agency Interrogatories	2-2
	[2] Statutory Reporting Requirements	2-2
	[3] Intrusive Inspections and Searches	2-3
§ 2.02	The Statutory Framework	2-5
	[1] Comprehensive Environmental Response, Cleanup and Liability Act	2-5
	[a] Section 104(e) Information Requests	2-5
	[b] Power to Inspect	2-12
	[c] Sanctions	2-13
	[d] Administrative Subpoenas	2-13
	[2] Resource Conservation and Recovery Act	2-15
	[a] Power to Inspect	2-15
	[b] Enforcement and Sanctions	2-16
	[3] Clean Water Act	2-17
	[a] Discharge Monitoring Reports	2-17
	[b] Inspections	2-20
	[c] Sanctions	2-21
	[4] Clean Air Act	2-26
	[a] Inspections	2-27
	[b] Self-Monitoring and Reporting Requirements	2-29
	[c] Administrative Subpoenas	2-30
	[d] Sanctions	2-31
	[5] Emergency Planning and Community Right-to-Know Act	2-36
	[a] Providing Information	2-36
	[b] Sanctions	2-39
	[6] Frank R. Lautenberg Chemical Safety for the 21st Century Act (Toxic Substances Control Act)	2-40

TABLE OF CONTENTS

xi

[a]	Inspections	2-41
[b]	Sanctions	2-42
[7]	Other Environmental Acts with Information Provisions	2-42

CHAPTER 3

Dealing with Government Investigatory Demands

§ 3.01	Introduction	3-2
§ 3.02	Difficulty of Obtaining Meaningful Review of Government Investigatory Demands	3-3
	[1] Pre-Enforcement Review	3-3
	[2] Standards of Review	3-4
§ 3.03	The Government's Demand for Entry	3-5
	[1] Responding to Demands for Entry and Inspection	3-5
	[2] Restraints on Civil Inspections	3-5
	[3] Standards for Obtaining an Administrative Warrant	3-9
	[4] Warrantless Inspection Pursuant to Statutory Authority	3-18
§ 3.04	Scope of Response to an Information Request	3-23
	[1] What Kind of Information Must Be Provided?	3-23
	[a] Financial Information	3-23
	[i] Financial Records	3-23
	[ii] Financial Information from Parent Entities	3-24
	[b] Redundant Information	3-25
	[2] Scope of Investigation by Recipient	3-25
	[3] Assertions of Confidentiality and Privilege	3-29
	[a] Trade Secrets	3-29
	[b] Privilege	3-30
	[i] Attorney-Client Privilege	3-32
	[ii] Attorney Work-Product	3-38
	[iii] Self-Critical Analysis	3-42
	[4] Can the Government Speak with a Facility's Employees?	3-44
§ 3.05	"Reasonable Basis"	3-46
	[1] Sufficient Cause	3-46
	[2] The Paperwork Reduction Act	3-49
§ 3.06	Application of Sanctions for Insufficient Response	3-51
§ 3.07	The Takings Issue	3-55
§ 3.08	Combining Statutes for Tougher Results	3-57
§ 3.09	Handling the Investigatory Stage	3-58
	[1] Mixed Questions of Law, Fact and Tactics	3-58

ENVIRONMENTAL ENFORCEMENT

	[2] Written Requests for Information	3-58
	[3] Reporting Requirements Incident to Permits and Regulated Activities	3-59
	[4] Inspections and Administrative Searches	3-59
§ 3.10	Conclusion	3-61

CHAPTER 4**Penalties and Penalty Policies**

§ 4.01	Introduction	4-3
	[1] Overview	4-3
	[2] Distinguishing Civil and Criminal Penalties	4-8
	[3] The Environmental Appeals Board	4-10
	[4] Chapter Preview	4-11
§ 4.02	Counting Violations	4-12
	[1] General Description of the Problem	4-12
§ 4.03	Statutory Criteria	4-21
§ 4.04	The 1984 EPA Generic Policy on Civil Penalties	4-23
§ 4.05	The BEN Model: Determining Economic Benefit of Noncompliance	4-24
§ 4.06	The ABEL Model: Determining the Ability to Pay	4-29
§ 4.07	Statute-Specific Penalty Policies	4-31
	[1] Clean Air Act Penalty Policies	4-31
	[a] Clean Air Act Stationary Source Penalty Policy	4-31
	[i] Economic Benefit of Noncompliance	4-31
	[ii] Gravity Component	4-32
	[b] Supplementary Clean Air Act Penalty Policies	4-34
	[c] Judicial Decisions	4-38
	[2] The RCRA Civil Penalty Policy	4-40
	[a] Gravity	4-41
	[b] Economic Benefit of Noncompliance	4-43
	[c] Adjustment Factors	4-43
	[i] Good Faith Efforts to Comply	4-43
	[ii] Degree of Willfulness and/or Negligence	4-44
	[iii] History of Noncompliance	4-44
	[iv] Ability to Pay	4-44
	[v] Other Unique Factors	4-45
	[3] The Clean Water Act Civil Penalty Policies	4-45

TABLE OF CONTENTS

xiii

[a]	The General Clean Water Act Penalty Policy	4-45
[i]	Clean Water Act Penalty Calculation	4-47
[ii]	Economic Benefit	4-47
[iii]	Gravity Component	4-47
[iv]	Gravity Component Adjustment Factors	4-51
[v]	Other Considerations	4-52
[b]	The Clean Water Act Dredge and Fill Penalty Policy	4-53
[c]	Judicial Decisions	4-55
[4]	The CERCLA and EPCRA Penalty Policies	4-58
[a]	Emergency Planning and Notification	4-58
[i]	Nature of the Violation	4-59
[ii]	Extent Level	4-61
[iii]	Gravity Level	4-62
[iv]	Circumstances	4-62
[v]	Multi-Day Penalties	4-63
[vi]	Penalty Factors Relating to the Violator	4-63
[b]	Toxic Chemical Emissions Reports	4-65
[c]	CERCLA <i>De Minimis</i> and <i>De Micromis</i> Waste Contributors	4-71
[d]	Calculating Amount of Civil Penalty Settlement and Punitive Damages for Failure to Comply with an Administrative Order	4-72
§ 4.08	Penalty Mitigation Through Environmental Benefit Projects	4-75

CHAPTER 5

Temporary Restraining Orders, Preliminary Injunctions, and Stays Pending Appeal in Environmental Litigation

§ 5.01	Introduction	5-2
§ 5.02	Rules Governing Interlocutory Injunctive Relief	5-4
§ 5.03	Preliminary Injunctions	5-6
[1]	Standards for Granting Relief	5-6
[a]	The Second Circuit	5-6
[b]	The Ninth Circuit	5-7
[c]	Other Circuits	5-8
[2]	The Nature of Irreparable Injury	5-9
[a]	Proof of Irreparable Harm	5-12

ENVIRONMENTAL ENFORCEMENT

	[b] Failure to Prove Irreparable Harm. . . .	5-15
	[c] Balancing the Public Interest.	5-16
	[d] Problems in Demonstrating Irreparable Injury in Air and Water Cases	5-18
	[e] NEPA Cases.	5-19
	[3] Avoiding the Burden of Proving Irreparable Injury.	5-22
	[a] General Rule.	5-22
	[b] Analysis of Supreme Court Authority	5-22
	[c] Statutory Basis	5-27
	[d] Imminent Endangerment Provisions. . .	5-30
	[4] Innovative Applications of Injunction in the Environmental Context	5-35
	[5] Injunctions Against Regulatory Agencies. . .	5-36
§ 5.04	Procedures for Obtaining a Preliminary Injunction	5-37
	[1] Timing	5-37
	[2] Required Documents.	5-37
	[3] Affidavits.	5-38
	[4] Other Supporting Material	5-38
	[5] Live Testimony	5-39
	[6] Use of Discovery.	5-39
	[7] Consolidated or Accelerated Proceedings. . . .	5-39
§ 5.05	Strategy on Motions for a Preliminary Injunction:	5-40
	[1] Movant's Tactical Advantages	5-40
	[2] Ascertaining the Necessity of a Hearing. . . .	5-40
	[3] Movant's Preparation	5-40
	[4] Beating the Trial Calendar	5-40
	[5] Respondent's Tactics.	5-41
§ 5.06	Temporary Restraining Orders	5-42
	[1] Nature of the Temporary Restraining Order	5-42
	[2] <i>Ex Parte</i> Grants of TROs.	5-44
	[3] Protection Against <i>Ex Parte</i> Grants.	5-45
	[4] Emergency Nature of the TRO	5-46
§ 5.07	Other Aspects of Preliminary Injunctions and Temporary Restraining Orders.	5-47
	[1] Findings and Conclusions.	5-47
	[2] Orders	5-47
	[3] Security for Preliminary Injunctions	5-48
§ 5.08	Motions for Stays Pending Appeal and Scope of Appellate Review.	5-51

CHAPTER 6

The Criminal Process in Environmental Regulation

§ 6.01	Overview: The Interface Between Environmental Law and Criminal Justice	6-2
	[1] Unique Characteristics of the Criminal System.	6-4
	[2] The Prosecutor.	6-4
	[3] The Grand Jury	6-5
	[4] Limitations on Defense Counsel	6-7
§ 6.02	Federal Law of Environmental Crimes	6-9
	[1] Introduction	6-9
	[2] The Development of the Environmental Criminal Statutes	6-9
	[3] The Federal Statutes	6-10
	[a] The Clean Air Act	6-10
	[i] Development of the Statute	6-10
	[ii] Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990.	6-12
	[b] The Clean Water Act	6-16
	[i] Development of the Statute	6-16
	[ii] Clean Water Act of 1987.	6-17
	[c] The Resource Conservation and Recovery Act	6-23
	[i] Illegal Transportation and Disposal of Hazardous Waste	6-23
	[ii] Material Omissions and Falsification of RCRA Records.	6-24
	[iii] Destruction or Alteration of RCRA Records Relating to Non-Listed Wastes.	6-24
	[iv] Knowing Endangerment.	6-27
	[v] The “Mixture Rule” and the “Derived-From Rule”	6-30.2
	[d] Regulation of Chemicals	6-32
	[i] The Federal Insecticide, Fungicide and Rodenticide Act	6-32
	[ii] The Toxic Substances Control Act	6-34
	[e] Superfund	6-36.1
	[f] Reporting Violations	6-37
§ 6.03	The Element of <i>Mens Rea</i>	6-42
	[1] Introduction	6-42
	[2] <i>Mens Rea</i> and RCRA	6-54
	[2A] <i>Mens Rea</i> and the Clean Water Act.	6-61

ENVIRONMENTAL ENFORCEMENT

	[3]	The Negligence Standard	6-64
	[4]	Exceptions to <i>Mens Rea</i> ; the Misdemeanor . . .	6-66
		[a] Public Welfare Statutes	6-66
		[b] Responsible Corporate Officers	6-68
		[c] Willful Blindness	6-73
	[5]	Mistake of Fact and Mistake of Law	6-74
	[6]	Corporate Liability for Individual Actions	6-75
	[7]	State Approaches to <i>Mens Rea</i>	6-76.1
§ 6.04		State Enforcement of Environmental Criminal Statutes	6-76.3

CHAPTER 7**Criminal Representation and Defense
in Environmental Law**

§ 7.01		The Defense of Alleged Environmental Crimes	7-2
	[1]	Reasons for the Institution of Criminal Proceedings	7-2
	[2]	Guidelines for the Initiation of Criminal Proceedings	7-3
	[3]	Conducting the Pretrial Defense	7-5
	[4]	The Use of Scientific Data	7-6
	[5]	Competing Tensions	7-10
	[6]	Structuring the Approach to the Prosecutor	7-12
§ 7.02		Representation of the Corporate Client	7-17
	[1]	General Considerations	7-17
	[2]	Violations Committed During the Corporate Response	7-17
	[3]	Interview of Employees	7-25
	[4]	Search and Seizure—Criminal Investigation at the Gate	7-26
	[5]	The Grand Jury	7-28
	[6]	The Corporate Response	7-29
	[7]	Relationship with the Corporation’s Employees	7-33
		[a] Nontarget Employees	7-33
		[b] Targeted Employees	7-34
	[8]	Department of Justice Guidelines on Prosecuting Corporations	7-37
§ 7.03		Disposition of the Criminal Case	7-42.3
	[1]	Disposition and Global Considerations	7-42.3
		[a] The Question: To Plead or Not to Plead	7-42.3
		[b] The Federal Sentencing Guidelines	7-42.3
		[c] Global Settlements	7-46

TABLE OF CONTENTS

xvii

	[d] Parallel Civil and Criminal Enforcement Proceedings	7-47
[2]	Need for Confidentiality	7-54
[3]	Plea Bargaining	7-55
[4]	Structuring the Settlement of a Criminal Case	7-55
[5]	Subsequent Civil Proceedings	7-55
	[a] Suspension and Debarment	7-56
	[i] Statutory Provisions	7-56
	[ii] The Regulatory Framework	7-58
	[b] SEC Disclosure	7-58.1
	[c] Bad Actor Disqualifications	7-62
§ 7.04	Significance of Criminal Prosecution	7-65

CHAPTER 8

The Whys, Whens and Hows of Environmental Self-Auditing

§ 8.01	Introduction	8-3
§ 8.02	What Is an Environmental Audit?	8-7
	[1] Introduction	8-7
	[2] Sources for Guidance on Self-Policing and Auditing	8-8
	[3] Substantive Goals of an Environmental Compliance Audit	8-9
§ 8.03	The Benefits of Effective Environmental Auditing	8-10
	[1] Introduction	8-10
	[2] The Imposition of Significant Civil Penalties	8-10
	[3] Economic Benefits of Environmental Auditing	8-11
	[4] Exercising “Environmental Triage”	8-12
	[a] Tort Liability	8-13
	[b] Criminal Liability	8-13
	[5] Mitigation of Penalties as a Result of an Existing Audit Program	8-13
	[a] EPA Policy	8-14
	[i] History of EPA Auditing Policies	8-14
	[ii] The EPA’s 2000 Audit Policy	8-15
	[b] Department of Justice Policy	8-22
	[c] The Federal Sentencing Guidelines	8-24
	[d] Self-Auditing Benefits Under Existing Federal Statute	8-24
	[e] Self-Auditing Benefits Under Existing Federal Statute	8-26

ENVIRONMENTAL ENFORCEMENT

	[f]	State Self-Auditing Privilege and Immunity Legislation	8-26
	[i]	Typical Audit Privilege Legislation	8-27
	[ii]	Typical Audit Immunity Legislation	8-28
	[6]	Benefits Listed by the General Accounting Office	8-28
§ 8.04		How to Conduct an Effective Environmental Audit	8-29
	[1]	Dangers of Ineffective Auditing	8-29
	[2]	Principles of Effective Environmental Auditing	8-29
	[3]	Who Should Conduct the Audit?	8-30
	[a]	Independent Auditors	8-30
	[b]	The Use of Counsel	8-31
	[4]	The Actual Performance of the Audit	8-33
	[a]	Overview of Concerns	8-33
	[b]	The Audit Process	8-34
	[c]	Management Commitment: Designing the Scope of the Audit and the Use of Checklists	8-34
	[d]	Review of Available Institutional Records	8-35
	[e]	The Auditor's Areas of Concern	8-36
	[f]	Prior Directives, Orders, and Consent Decrees	8-37
	[g]	Discharge of Wastewater	8-37
	[h]	Air Emissions	8-38
	[i]	Treatment, Storage, and Disposal of Hazardous Wastes	8-38
	[j]	Above and Below Ground Storage Tanks	8-40
	[k]	Toxic Substances	8-40
	[l]	Superfund	8-40
	[m]	Reporting Requirements	8-40
	[5]	Making Sure the Documents Are Accurate	8-41
	[6]	Employee Interviews: Getting the Facts	8-42
	[7]	The Facility Inspection	8-42
	[8]	Verification of Data	8-44
	[9]	Writing the Environmental Audit Report	8-46
	[10]	Review Reconciliation and Implementation	8-48
§ 8.05		Minimizing the Risks Associated with Environmental Auditing	8-49
	[1]	The Risks	8-49
	[2]	Maintaining, to the Greatest Extent Possible, the Confidentiality of the Audit	8-49
	[3]	The Attorney-Client Privilege	8-50

TABLE OF CONTENTS

xix

	[a]	The Requisite Elements of the Privilege	8-50
	[b]	Waiver of the Privilege	8-52
	[c]	The Limits of the Privilege	8-54
	[d]	Recommended Practices for Document Creation, Handling, Distribution, and Storage.	8-55
	[4]	The Work Product Doctrine	8-56
	[5]	The Self-Evaluation Privilege.	8-63
	[a]	Judicial Development	8-63
	[6]	The Risk of Waiver Through Prosecution.	8-64
§ 8.06		Environmental Compliance Procedures Beyond Auditing	8-65
	[1]	Auditing and Environmental Management.	8-65
	[a]	Line Management Attention to Compliance	8-65
	[b]	Integration of Environmental Policies, Standards, and Procedures.	8-66
	[c]	Auditing, Monitoring, Reporting, and Tracking	8-66
	[i]	Frequent Auditing.	8-66
	[ii]	Continuous On-Site Monitoring	8-66
	[iii]	Internal Reporting.	8-66
	[iv]	Tracking Response Status	8-67
	[v]	Redundant Checks	8-67
	[d]	Employee Training.	8-67
	[e]	Incentives for Compliance.	8-67
	[f]	Discipline for Noncompliance	8-67
	[2]	The “ISO 14000” Standards	8-68
	[3]	EMS Software	8-75
	[4]	The CERES Principles	8-76
§ 8.07		Dealing with the Public and the Press.	8-79
	[1]	Community Involvement.	8-79
	[2]	Dealing with the Press	8-79
§ 8.08		Conclusion.	8-83

CHAPTER 9

Civil Enforcement Under the Clean Water Act

§ 9.01		Introduction	9-3
§ 9.02		Antecedents	9-4
§ 9.03		The Clean Water Act Amendments of 1972.	9-6
§ 9.04		The Permit System	9-8
	[1]	Navigable Waters	9-11
	[2]	Point Sources.	9-14
	[3]	National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System Permits.	9-20

ENVIRONMENTAL ENFORCEMENT

	[4]	State Pollutant Discharge Elimination System Permits	9-20.1
	[5]	Technology-Based and Water-Quality-Based Standards	9-22
		[a] Technology-Based Standards	9-22
		[b] Water-Quality-Based Standards	9-23
	[6]	Water Quality Criteria for Toxics	9-24
	[7]	Toxic Pollutant Standards	9-24.2
	[8]	State Standards	9-24.3
§ 9.05		The Pretreatment Regulatory Program	9-25
	[1]	Introduction	9-25
	[2]	Prohibited Discharges	9-26
	[3]	Categorical Standards	9-27
	[4]	Other Controls	9-28
§ 9.06		Nonpoint Source Control	9-30
	[1]	Stormwater Pollution	9-31
	[2]	Federal Regulation of Stormwater Discharges	9-31
		[a] Stormwater from Industrial Activities	9-32
		[b] Municipal Separate Sewer Systems	9-33
		[c] Stormwater from Construction Activities	9-34
§ 9.07		Wetlands	9-37
	[1]	Introduction	9-37
	[2]	Potentially Liable Parties	9-40
	[3]	Administrative Enforcement	9-40
	[4]	Civil Judicial Enforcement	9-43
	[5]	Settlement	9-45
	[6]	Governmental Policy	9-45
	[7]	Criminal Enforcement	9-45
§ 9.08		Oil Spills	9-47
§ 9.09		Civil Enforcement Under the Clean Water Act	9-50
	[1]	Varied Enforcement	9-50
	[2]	Discretion in Enforcement	9-50
	[3]	Federal Enforcement	9-51
	[4]	Administrative Enforcement	9-52
	[5]	Court Injunctions	9-54
	[6]	Emergency Power	9-55
	[7]	Citizen Suits	9-56
§ 9.10		Defenses	9-58
	[1]	Introduction	9-58
	[2]	Initial Considerations	9-58
		[a] Permit Writing	9-58
		[i] Mixing Zones	9-61
		[ii] Biologically Available Metals	9-62
		[iii] Minimum Levels of Quantification for Discharge Permit Limits	9-63

TABLE OF CONTENTS

xxi

	[iv] Cooling Water Intake Structures	9-64
[b]	Variances.	9-65
	[i] The Fundamentally Different Factors Variance	9-65
	[ii] Section 301(g) Variance.	9-65
	[iii] Thermal Discharges	9-66
	[iv] “Variances” From Water Quality Standards.	9-66
	[v] Intake Water	9-68
[c]	The Anti-Backsliding Provision.	9-68
[d]	Well-Trained Personnel	9-70
[e]	Fast Action in the Event of Exceedance.	9-70
[3]	Bypasses and Upsets.	9-70
	[a] Upsets	9-70
	[b] Bypasses	9-73
[4]	Sampling Error	9-74
[5]	The Permit Shield	9-76
[6]	Violation-Counting Issues.	9-77
[7]	Litigating the Penalty	9-80
[8]	Defenses in Citizen Suits	9-83
	[a] Inadequate Notice.	9-83
	[b] Wholly Past Violation	9-83
	[c] Prior State or Federal Enforcement.	9-84
	[d] State Provisions More Stringent Than Federal Provisions	9-84
[9]	Inadequate Defenses	9-84
	[a] Good Faith Effort Not a Reliable Defense	9-84
	[b] Economic or Business Necessity Not a Defense	9-85
	[c] Impossibility	9-85

CHAPTER 10

Civil Enforcement Under the Clean Air Act

§ 10.01	Introduction	10-1
§ 10.02	The Clean Air Act’s Alphabet Soup: NAAQS, NESHAPs, and SIPs	10-3
	[1] NAAQS	10-3
	[2] NESHAPs	10-5
	[3] SIPs	10-7
§ 10.03	The Clean Air Act’s Title V Permit Program.	10-9
	[1] Permits and Parameters.	10-13
	[2] Allaying the Fears of Business.	10-15
§ 10.04	Information Gathering	10-17

ENVIRONMENTAL ENFORCEMENT

§ 10.05	Federal Enforcement Provisions	10-25
	[1] Compliance Orders	10-27
	[2] Administrative Penalties	10-29
	[3] Field Citations	10-31
	[4] Federal Court Action	10-32
	[5] Judicial Review	10-33
	[6] Newer Federal Enforcement Tools	10-34
	[7] Civil Penalty Policies	10-40
§ 10.06	Defenses Under the Clean Air Act	10-53
§ 10.07	Climate Change Enforcement	10-62

CHAPTER 11**Civil Enforcement Under the Resource
Conservation and Recovery Act**

§ 11.01	Introduction	11-2
§ 11.02	The Management of Hazardous Waste	11-5
	[1] Solid Waste	11-5
	[2] Hazardous Waste	11-7
	[3] The Subpart C Characteristics	11-8
	[4] Testing for the Toxicity Characteristic	11-9
	[5] The Part 261 Subpart D Lists	11-11
	[6] Special Provisions for Certain Hazardous Waste	11-13
	[7] Generators of Hazardous Waste	11-15
	[a] Generators' Manifest Requirements	11-17
	[b] Generators' Pre-Transport Requirements	11-18
	[c] Generators' Recordkeeping and Reporting	11-19
	[d] Exports by Generators	11-20
	[8] Transporters of Hazardous Waste	11-21
	[9] TSD Owners or Operators	11-21
	[a] On-Site Generators Storing Wastes Less Than Ninety Days	11-21
	[b] All Other Owners and Operators	11-22
	[10] Corrective Action	11-23
	[a] Applicability	11-24
	[b] Regulatory Requirements for Corrective Action	11-24
	[c] Corrective Action Management Units	11-25
	[d] Temporary Units	11-26
	[e] What Is a Facility for Corrective Action Purposes?	11-26
	[f] Corrective Action and Contribution	11-27
	[11] Land Disposal Restrictions	11-27

TABLE OF CONTENTS

xxiii

§ 11.03	Regulation of Underground Storage Tanks	11-29
§ 11.04	Permits	11-33
§ 11.05	Federal Enforcement	11-35
	[1] Compliance Orders, Administrative Penalties and Injunctive Relief	11-38
	[2] Civil Penalties	11-39
	[a] Gravity	11-39
	[b] Economic Benefit of Noncompliance	11-40
	[c] Adjustment Factors	11-41
	[i] Good Faith Efforts to Comply	11-41
	[ii] Degree of Willfulness and/or Negligence	11-41
	[iii] History of Noncompliance	11-42
	[iv] Ability to Pay	11-42
	[v] Other Unique Factors	11-42
	[3] Interim Status Corrective Action	11-42
	[4] Consent Orders	11-42
	[5] Criminal Action	11-44
	[6] The Likelihood of Enforcement	11-45
	[7] What to Expect in a RCRA Investigation	11-47
§ 11.06	State Reinforcement	11-48
	[1] The Statutory Requirements	11-48
	[2] The RCRA Grant Program	11-48
§ 11.07	Defenses	11-50
	[1] Statutory Defenses	11-51
	[2] Definitional Defenses	11-52
	[3] Procedural Defenses	11-54
	[4] Regulatory Exclusions	11-57
	[5] Other Defenses	11-57
	[a] Recycling	11-57
	[b] Safe Storage	11-59
	[c] Compliance with Other Statutes	11-59
	[d] The Household Waste Exclusion	11-60
§ 11.08	Citizen Suits	11-61

CHAPTER 12

Structure of the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act

§ 12.01	Overview of CERCLA	12-3
	[1] Introduction	12-3
	[2] Hastily Drafted Legislation	12-4
	[3] Basic Structure of CERCLA	12-10
	[a] Five Basic Components	12-10
	[b] Liability: Strict, Retroactive, and Perhaps Joint and Several	12-11

ENVIRONMENTAL ENFORCEMENT

	[i]	Strict Liability	12-12
	[ii]	Retroactive Liability	12-14
	[iii]	Joint and Several Liability Under CERCLA	12-15
	[4]	Causation	12-18
§ 12.02		The National Priorities List	12-22
	[1]	Introduction	12-22
	[2]	How Sites Are Listed	12-23
	[a]	The State Role in Site Selection	12-24
	[b]	The Hazard Ranking System	12-25
	[c]	Listing Because of Health Threats	12-26
	[d]	Delisting After Cleanup	12-26
§ 12.03		The National Contingency Plan	12-28
§ 12.04		The Heart of CERCLA—Section 107 Liability	12-30
	[1]	Parties Liable	12-30
	[a]	Current Owners and Operators	12-31
	[i]	Lessors and Lessees	12-36
	[ii]	Banks and Financing Institutions	12-38
	[iii]	Past Owners	12-41
	[b]	Liability of Arrangers or Generators	12-44
	[c]	Liability of Transporters	12-48
	[d]	Statutory and Common Law Approaches to Finding Additional Solvent Parties	12-49
	[i]	Parent and Subsidiary Corporations	12-50
	[ii]	“Direct” CERCLA Statutory Liability	12-52
	[iii]	“Indirect” CERCLA Liability Through Developing Common Law	12-58
	[e]	Continuity of Enterprise – Mere Continuation Test in Detail	12-65
§ 12.05		Defenses	12-66.1
	[1]	Standard Statutory Defenses	12-66.1
	[a]	Act of God	12-66.1
	[b]	Act of War	12-66.2
	[c]	Third Party Defense	12-66.2
	[2]	Other Statutory Defenses	12-66.4
	[a]	The Innocent Purchaser Defense	12-66.4
	[b]	Secured Creditor Defense	12-66.6
	[c]	The Consumer Product Exception	12-66.7
	[d]	The Scope of “Release” to the “Environment”	12-66.9
	[e]	The Petroleum Exclusion	12-66.10
	[f]	The Pesticide Exclusion	12-66.11
	[g]	Federally Permitted Release	12-66.12

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	[h]	Naturally Occurring Substances	12-66.13
	[i]	Statute of Limitations	12-66.13
	[j]	Recycling	12-66.20
[3]		The Small Business Liability Relief and Brownfields Revitalization Act	12-66.21
	[a]	Liability Defenses for “ <i>De Micromis</i> ” Waste and Municipal Solid Waste	12-66.22
	[b]	Ability to Pay	12-66.23
	[c]	Contiguous Property Defense	12-66.23
	[d]	<i>Bona Fide</i> Prospective Purchaser	12-66.25
	[e]	Amendments to the Innocent Landowner Defense	12-66.27
	[f]	Limits on Federal Response Actions at Sites Subject to Response Actions Pursuant to State Law	12-66.30
§ 12.06		Costs of Response	12-66.32
	[1]	Limited Damages	12-66.32
	[2]	Removal and Remediation Costs	12-66.34
	[3]	Oversight and Indirect Costs	12-66.35
	[4]	Interest	12-66.36
	[5]	Determining the Necessity of Response Costs	12-66.37
§ 12.07		Cleanup Standards for Response Actions	12-67
	[1]	Introduction	12-67
	[2]	Statutory Basis	12-67
	[a]	Preference for Permanent Remedies and On-Site Treatment	12-68
	[b]	Considerations for Alternative Remedies	12-68
	[3]	Degree of Cleanup	12-70
	[4]	Standards for On-Site Cleanups	12-73
	[5]	Standards Applicable to Off-Site Transfers	12-75
§ 12.08		Natural Resource Damages	12-76
	[1]	Introduction: The Statutory and Regulatory Scheme	12-76
	[a]	Statutory Basis	12-76
	[b]	Regulatory Implementation	12-80
		[i] Designation of the Trustee	12-81
		[ii] Assessment of Damages	12-81
	[c]	What Constitutes a Natural Resource?	12-82
	[2]	Natural Resource Damage Defenses	12-84
	[a]	Limitation on Costs	12-84
	[b]	Date of Injury to Natural Resource	12-84
	[c]	Statute of Limitations	12-86
	[d]	Environmental Impact Statement or Permit Language	12-87
	[e]	The Trustee’s Authority	12-89

CHAPTER 13

**Enforcement and Initiatives Under the
Comprehensive Environmental Response,
Compensation and Liability Act**

§ 13.01	Government Enforcement	13-3
	[1] Overview of EPA Enforcement	
	Approaches	13-3
	[2] Fund-Financed Actions	13-4
	[3] Unilateral Remediation Orders Under	
	Section 106	13-6
	[a] Introduction	13-6
	[b] The Statutory Scheme	13-7
	[c] Government Enforcement Policy	
	Under Section 106	13-10
	[i] Introduction	13-10
	[ii] What the EPA Looks for Before	
	Issuing a Section 106	
	Order	13-13
	[d] “Sufficient Cause”	13-14
	[e] The Consequence of Section 106	
	Noncompliance	13-18
	[f] Claims for Reimbursement	
	from the Fund	13-20
	[4] Challenges to Agency Listing Procedure	13-21
	[a] Procedural Obstacles to Judicial	
	Review	13-21
	[b] Deferential Standard of Review	13-23
	[c] Challenges on Technical Grounds	13-23
	[5] Emerging Defenses	13-25
	[a] The Government’s Advantage	13-25
	[b] Leveling the Legal Playing	
	Field—Divisibility of Harm	13-26
	[c] Unreasonable Response Costs	13-33
	[d] Oversight Costs	13-34
	[e] Retreat from Judicial Deference	13-35
	[6] Administrative Reform and Enforcement	13-35
	[a] Orphan Shares—Reform	
	and Reality	13-36
	[b] Partial NPL De-Listing	13-37
	[c] Allocation Pilot Projects	13-38
§ 13.02	Litigation Strategies	13-39
	[1] Government Litigation Strategies	13-39
	[2] Defendant’s Litigation Strategy	13-41
§ 13.03	Negotiated Settlements and Consent	
	Decrees Under CERCLA	13-45
	[1] Overview	13-45

TABLE OF CONTENTS

xxvii

	[2]	Statutory Framework	13-46
		[a] Statutory Incentives to Settle	13-46
		[i] Covenant Not to Sue	13-46
		[ii] Contribution Protection	13-48
		[iii] Other Actions	13-49
		[iv] Nonsettlor Rights	13-50
		[b] Lodging and Public Comment	13-50
		[c] Intervention Issues	13-50
		[i] Timeliness	13-51
		[ii] Protectable Interest	13-51
		[d] Effects of Settlement Agreement	13-52
	[3]	The EPA’s Model Consent Decree	13-52
		[a] Introduction	13-52
		[b] Provisions of the Model Consent Decree	13-53
		[c] Changes Effected by the Revised Model Consent Decree	13-54
		[d] Section 113(f)(3)(b) Contribution Claim Changes	13-56
	[4]	Negotiating the Consent Decree	13-56
		[a] Contribution Protection and Opposition from Other Defendants	13-61
		[i] “Equitable Share” or “Amount of Settlement”?	13-61
		[ii] Government or Private Party Plaintiff?	13-62
		[iii] Bar Orders Precluding Section 107 Cost Recovery Claims	13-64
		[b] Settlement Litigation by Nonsettlers	13-64
§ 13.04		Private Claims for Relief Under CERCLA	13-68
	[1]	Express Claim for Relief	13-68
	[2]	Claims for Contribution and Claims for Cost Recovery	13-69
		[a] Distinction Between Claims	13-69
		[b] Pre- <i>Aviall</i> Caselaw	13-71
		[c] <i>Aviall</i> and Post- <i>Aviall</i> Cases	13-72
		[d] Right of Contribution	13-81
		[e] Orphan Shares	13-83
		[f] Allocation Standards	13-89
		[g] PRP Allocation	13-98
	[3]	Consistency with the National Contingency Plan	13-100
		[a] Substantial or Strict Compliance with the NCP	13-100
		[b] Which NCP Applies?	13-103
	[4]	Tactics and Strategy	13-103
		[a] Pleadings	13-103

ENVIRONMENTAL ENFORCEMENT

	[b]	Third and Multiparty Practice	13-104
	[c]	Bifurcation	13-107
	[d]	Marshalling the Evidence.	13-108
[5]		Response Costs Recoverable Under Section 107	13-109
[6]		Related Claims for Relief.	13-110
[7]		Award of Attorneys' Fees	13-116
	[a]	Supreme Court Resolution of Conflicting Decisions Against General Recovery	13-116
	[b]	Distinctions Among Grants of Attorneys' Fees in Citizen Suits Under Sections 107, 113, and 310 of CERCLA	13-118
§ 13.05		Moving Toward the Future: Common Sense and Brownfields Initiatives	13-119

CHAPTER 14**Civil Enforcement Under the Emergency Planning
and Community Right-to-Know Act (EPCRA)**

§ 14.01		Overview	14-2
§ 14.02		Statutory and Regulatory Framework	14-5
	[1]	The Reporting Requirements	14-5
	[a]	Emergency Notification	14-5
	[b]	Material Safety Data Sheet	14-8
	[c]	Emergency and Hazardous Chemical Inventory Forms.	14-9
	[d]	Toxic Chemical Release Forms (Form R)	14-11
	[e]	Other Information Requirements	14-15
	[f]	Public Access to Chemical Safety Information.	14-16
	[2]	Statutory Enforcement Provisions	14-17
	[a]	Statutory Penalties for EPCRA Violations.	14-17
		[i] Reporting Violations	14-17
		[ii] Trade Secret Claim Violations.	14-20
	[b]	Who Enforces EPCRA.	14-20.1
§ 14.03		Defenses.	14-20.2
	[1]	Defenses to Liability.	14-20.2
	[2]	Defenses in Citizen Suits Under EPCRA	14-31
§ 14.04		EPCRA Civil Penalty Policies	14-34
	[1]	The Form R Penalty Policy	14-34

TABLE OF CONTENTS

xxix

[a]	The Basic Form R Penalty	14-34
[b]	Adjustments Factors	14-36
	[i] Culpability	14-36
	[ii] Voluntary Disclosure	14-37
	[iii] History of Prior Violations	14-37
	[iv] Delisted Chemicals	14-38
	[v] Attitude	14-38
	[vi] “Other Factors as Justice May Require”	14-38
	[vii] Settlement with Conditions	14-39
	[viii] Ability to Pay	14-39
[2]	Penalty Policy for Other EPCRA Requirements	14-40
	[a] Introduction	14-40
	[b] Calculating the Base Penalty	14-40
	[i] The “Nature” of the Violation	14-40
	[ii] The “Extent” of the Violation	14-41
	[iii] The “Gravity” of the Violation	14-43
	[iv] “Circumstances” and the Base Penalty Matrices	14-44
	[c] Assessment of Multi-Day Penalties	14-46
	[d] Individual Adjustment Factors	14-46
	[i] Ability to Pay	14-47
	[ii] Prior History of Violations	14-47
	[iii] Degree of Culpability	14-47
	[iv] Economic Benefit or Savings	14-48
	[v] Other Matters as Justice May Require	14-48
	[vi] Business Size	14-48
	[vii] Attitude	14-49
	[viii] Supplemental Environmental Projects	14-49
	[ix] Voluntary Disclosure	14-49
§ 14.05	Applying the EPCRA Penalty Policies	14-50

CHAPTER 15

Citizen Suits, and the Award of Attorneys’ Fees in Environmental Litigation

§ 15.01	Overview	15-3
§ 15.02	Citizen Suits	15-5
	[1] Legislative Intent	15-5
	[2] Statutory Provisions	15-6

ENVIRONMENTAL ENFORCEMENT

	[a]	The Clean Water Act	15-9
	[b]	The Clean Air Act	15-12
	[c]	The Resource Conservation and Recovery Act	15-17
	[d]	Emergency Planning and Community Right-to-Know Act	15-25
	[e]	Toxic Substances Control Act	15-28
	[f]	Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation and Liability Act	15-28
	[3]	Preservation of Existing Remedies (Savings Clauses)	15-30
	[4]	Who May Sue	15-30
	[5]	Who May Be Sued	15-31
	[6]	Where Suit May Be Brought	15-32
	[7]	Private Intervention in Government Litigation	15-33
§ 15.03		Litigation Strategies	15-35
	[1]	Suits Against the Administrator	15-35
	[2]	Supplemental Claims for Relief	15-37
	[3]	Plaintiffs' Strategies	15-40
	[a]	Selection of Targets	15-40
	[b]	Thorough Investigation	15-40
	[c]	Maximize Number of Counts	15-40
	[d]	Timing of Litigation	15-40
	[e]	Relationship with Regulatory Agency	15-41
	[f]	Standing	15-41
	[g]	Pleading the Violation	15-41
	[h]	Increased Risk of Injury	15-41
	[i]	Aggressive Conduct	15-42
	[j]	Getting to Judgment	15-43
	[4]	Defense Strategies	15-43
	[a]	General Considerations	15-43
	[b]	Control of Reactions	15-43
	[c]	Dealing in Candor	15-43
	[d]	Using the Sixty- or Ninety-Day Window	15-43
	[e]	Fighting the Allegations of Wrongdoing	15-44
	[f]	Technical Defenses	15-44
	[i]	Lack of Standing	15-45
	[ii]	Lack or Inadequacy of Notice	15-57
	[iii]	When Suit May Be Brought Immediately Upon Notice	15-60
	[iv]	Statute of Limitations	15-62
	[v]	Wholly Past Violations	15-62
	[vi]	Mootness	15-70

TABLE OF CONTENTS xxxi

	[vii] Diligent Prosecution	15-72
	[viii] Prior Resolution	15-81
	[ix] Abstention and Primary Jurisdiction Doctrine	15-81
	[x] Upset Defense to Clean Water Act Prosecutions	15-82.2
	[g] Judicial Involvement	15-82.3
	[h] Impleading the Environmental Agency	15-82.3
	[i] Keeping an Eye on the Ball	15-82.3
[5]	Settlement and Relief	15-82.3
	[a] Negotiated Settlement	15-82.3
	[b] Litigated Relief	15-82.4
	[c] Relief Requested	15-82.5
§ 15.04	The Award of Attorneys' Fees	15-83
	[1] Introduction	15-83
	[2] Non-Statutory Exception for Award of Attorneys' Fees	15-83
	[3] General Statutory Exceptions	15-84
	[4] Statutory Provisions for the Award of Attorneys' Fees	15-85
	[5] Party Eligible for Award	15-87
	[6] The Size of the Attorney's Fee	15-91
	[7] Fees of Non-Testifying Experts	15-95
	[8] Award of Fees for Preparation of Fee Application	15-95
	[9] Procedures for Obtaining Attorneys' Fees	15-96
§ 15.05	Conclusion	15-98
INDEX	I-1