

Table of Contents

Chapter 1: Introduction.....	1
§1:01 Introduction to the Law of Insurer Bad Faith in Pennsylvania ...	1
§1:02 Bad Faith in Pennsylvania and Other Jurisdictions.....	2
§1:03 Common Law Bad Faith in Pennsylvania	2
§1:04 Issues Arising Under Pennsylvania’s Bad Faith Statute	3
§1:05 Court Decisions Concerning What May Be, and What is Not, Bad Faith.....	7
§1:06 Damages Recoverable in a Bad Faith Action	9
§1:07 Discovery in Bad Faith Litigation.....	10
§1:08 Additional Bad Faith Issues.....	11
Chapter 2: Historical Development of Bad Faith	13
§2:01 Overview.....	13
§2:02 Third Party Insurance Claims.....	14
§2:03 First Party Insurance Claims	15
§2:04 Development of the Law of Third Party Bad Faith in Other Jurisdictions.....	17
§2:05 Development of the Law of First Party Bad Faith in Other Jurisdictions.....	20
§2:06 The Development of the Law of Third Party Bad Faith in Pennsylvania.....	23
§2:07 Pre-1990 Law of First Party Bad Faith in Pennsylvania.....	25
§2:08 Pennsylvania’s Bad Faith Statute: 42 Pa. C.S.A. §8371.....	30
§2:09 Other Pennsylvania Remedies for Insurer Misconduct.....	32
Chapter 3: Common Law Bad Faith in Pennsylvania	35
§3:01 Overview.....	35
§3:02 The Seminal Case: <i>Cowden v. Aetna Casualty & Surety Co.</i> , 134 A.2d 223 (Pa. 1957).....	37
§3:03 Common Law Bad Faith Liability for Failure to Settle Claim Within Policy Limits.....	40
§3:04 —Cases.....	45
§3:05 Who May Assert a Third Party Bad Faith Claim.....	71
§3:06 —Cases.....	73

Table of Contents

§3:07 Damages Recoverable for Failure to Settle a Third-Party Claim 78

§3:08 —Cases..... 79

§3:09 Interplay Between a § 8371 Claim and a Third Party Common Law Bad Faith Claim 84

§3:10 —Cases..... 86

§3:11 The Questionable Expansion of the Third Party Common Law Bad Faith Claim..... 98

§3:12 —Cases..... 101

§3:13 Commentary..... 113

Chapter 4: Parties to a Bad Faith Action Under §8371 121

§4:01 Overview..... 121

§4:02 Who May Bring a Bad Faith Action 122

§4:03 —Cases Allowing Party to Bring Bad Faith Action 129

§4:04 —Cases Disallowing Party to Bring Bad Faith Action..... 133

§4:05 —Assignment of the Right to Bring a Bad Faith Claim 143

§4:06 —Validity of a Non-Assignment Clause..... 151

§4:07 Who May Be Sued for Bad Faith 156

§4:08 —Cases..... 160

§4:09 Reverse Bad Faith..... 168

§4:10 —Pennsylvania Cases Discussing Reverse Bad Faith 170

§4:11 Commentary..... 179

Chapter 5: The Nature and Scope of an Action Under §8371..... 183

§5:01 Overview..... 184

§5:02 §8371 as an Independent Cause of Action 185

§5:03 The Evolving First Party Common Law Bad Faith Action 188

§5:03(a) —Cases..... 192

§5:04 Relation of § 8371 Action to Breach of Contract Action 209

§5:04(a) —Need For a “Predicate Action” 209

§5:04(b) —Cases Involving Suit Limitation Clause in Policy 211

§5:04(c) —Cases Where There Is No Coverage Under the Policy 214

§5:04(d) —Cases Suggesting Bad Faith Claim May Proceed Irrespective of Whether There Is Coverage 222

§5:05 The Scope of Conduct Covered Under §8371 231

§5:05(a) —Cases Holding §8371 Applies to Bad Faith Toward an Insured, and Not to an Insurer’s General Business Practices 236

§5:05(b) —Cases Holding §8371 Does Not Apply to Acts Preceding the Formation of Insurance Contract..... 239

Table of Contents

§5:05(c) —Cases Suggesting §8371 Applies Only to Claims
 Denials and Claims Handling Issues..... 244

§5:05(d) —Cases More Broadly Interpreting §8371 257

§5:06 Whether Sustaining of Damages Is a Predicate of a Bad
 Faith Action 265

§5:07 Whether Plaintiff in a Bad Faith Case Must Prove
 Causation 270

§5:08 Commentary..... 276

Chapter 6: Defining Bad Faith Under §8371 287

§6:01 Overview..... 287

§6:02 A Two-Part Definition of Bad Faith 294

§6:02(a) —No Reasonable Basis for Denying a Claim..... 299

§6:02(b) —Knowing or Reckless Disregard of Lack of
 Reasonable Basis 305

§6:03 An Alternate Definition of Bad Faith? 311

§6:04 Is an Insurer a Fiduciary? 313

§6:05 —Cases..... 315

§6:06 Commentary..... 322

Chapter 7: Procedural Issues in Bad Faith Actions 327

§7:01(a) Overview..... 328

§7:01(b) Pleading Bad Faith 329

§7:02 —Cases, Plaintiff’s Pleading Found Insufficient..... 343

§7:03 —Cases, Plaintiff’s Pleading Found Sufficient 350

§7:04 Who Decides if Bad Faith Exists?..... 358

§7:04(a) —State Court Trials..... 361

§7:04(b) —Federal Court Trials..... 365

§7:04(c) —Arbitrations 367

§7:05 Commentary..... 370

§7:06 Ripeness of a Bad Faith Action..... 372

§7:07 The Applicable Burden of Proof for Bad Faith Actions 377

§7:08 Statute of Limitations Issues 380

§7:09 The Two-Year Statute of Limitations for §8371 Claims..... 382

§7:10 The Four-Year Statute of Limitations for Common Law
 Bad Faith Claims 386

§7:11 Application of the Statute of Limitations..... 388

§7:11(a) —Cases Holding That Statute of Limitations Expired 391

§7:11(b) —Cases Holding That Statute of Limitations Had
 Not Expired..... 409

§7:11(c) —Application of Limitation of Suit Provision in Policy 416

§7:12 Forum Selection Issues 420

Table of Contents

§7:13 Venue in State Court 422

§7:14 Venue in Federal Court 428

§7:15 —Cases, Federal Jurisdiction Allowed 434

§7:16 —Cases, Federal Jurisdiction Denied..... 445

§7:17 Commentary..... 456

§7:18 Motions for Summary Judgment 461

§7:18(a) —Cases Discussing Evidentiary Burden in Opposing
Summary Judgment 463

§7:18(b) —Summary Judgment in Favor of Insurer 469

§7:18(c) —Summary Judgment in Favor of Insured 473

§7:19 Bifurcation or Severance..... 473

§7:20 —Cases Allowing Bifurcation..... 479

§7:21 —Cases Not Allowing Bifurcation..... 487

§7:22 Bifurcation and Severance in Uninsured/Underinsured
Motorist Claims..... 495

§7:22(a) —Cases Permitting Bifurcation or Severance in
UM/UIM Scenario..... 498

§7:22(b) —Cases Not Permitting Bifurcation or Severance in
UM/UIM Scenario..... 510

§7:22(c) —Commentary 520

§7:23 Issues Involving Counsel..... 522

Chapter 8: Proving Bad Faith..... 529

§8:01 Overview..... 529

§8:02 The Unfair Insurance Practices Act (UIPA) and Related
Regulations 531

§8:03 Violations of the UIPA and Regulations as Relevant on the
Issue of Bad Faith 535

§8:04(a) —State Court Cases 541

§8:04(b) —Federal Court Cases 548

§8:05 Other Potential Indicators of Bad Faith Conduct..... 561

§8:06 Using Experts to Prove Bad Faith..... 566

§8:07 —Cases..... 570

§8:08 Commentary..... 593

Chapter 9: Examples Where Courts Have Found Bad Faith

May Exist..... 601

§9:01 Overview..... 602

§9:02 Unreasonable Delay in Handling Claims 604

§9:03(a) —Cases (Auto Claims)..... 609

§9:03(b) —Cases (Property Claims) 623

§9:03(c) —Cases (Other Claims)..... 630

§9:04 Inadequate Investigation or Legal Research..... 632

Table of Contents

§9:05(a) —Cases (Auto Claims).....	643
§9:05(b) —Cases (Property Claims).....	665
§9:05(c) —Cases (Other Claims).....	679
§9:06 Unreasonable Reliance on Independent Experts.....	694
§9:07 —Cases.....	697
§9:08 Unreasonable Interpretation or Application of Policy Provisions	708
§9:09(a) —Cases (Auto Claims).....	715
§9:09(b) —Cases (Property Claims).....	720
§9:09(c) —Cases (Other Claims).....	731
§9:10 Unreasonable Claim Determination Regarding UM/UIM Coverage.....	736
§9:11 —Cases.....	741
§9:12 Failure to Make Reasonable Offer of Settlement.....	753
§9:13(a) —Cases (Auto Claims).....	760
§9:13(b) —Cases (Property Claims).....	773
§9:13(c) —Cases (Other Claims).....	776
§9:14 Misrepresentation of Facts or Policy Provisions.....	780
§9:15 —Cases.....	783
§9:16 Unreasonable Refusal to Defend Third-Party Suit.....	798
§9:17 —Cases.....	801
§9:18 Other Improper Conduct by Insurer.....	811
§9:19 —Cases.....	814
§9:20 Litigation Conduct As Potentially Indicative of Bad Faith.....	827
§9:21(a) —Cases, Insurer Decision to Bring Litigation Against Its Insured.....	832
§9:21(b) —Cases, Conduct by Insurer or Counsel After the Institution of Litigation.....	836
§9:22 Releases.....	845
§9:23 —Cases.....	846
§9:24 Commentary.....	849

**Chapter 10: Examples Where Bad Faith Has Been Found Not
to Exist.....851**

§10:01 Overview.....	852
§10:02 Insurer Correctly Applies Policy Provisions in Denying Third Party Coverage.....	854
§10:02(a) —Cases.....	857
§10:03 Insurer Correctly Applies Policy Provisions in Determining First Party Claim.....	873
§10:03(a) —Cases, Auto.....	879

Table of Contents

§10:03(b) —Cases, Property..... 896
§10:03(c) —Cases, Life/Health/Disability/Other..... 911
§10:04 Insurer’s Interpretation of Policy, Though Wrong, Was
Reasonable..... 916
§10:05(a) —Cases, Auto 923
§10:05(b) —Cases, Property..... 932
§10:05(c) —Cases, Life/Health/Disability/Other..... 940
§10:06 Insurer’s Investigation and Claims Decision Was
Reasonable..... 948
§10:07(a) —Cases (Auto Claims)..... 961
§10:07(b) —Cases (Property Claims)..... 980
§10:07(c) —Cases (Life/Health/Disability Claims) 1002
§10:07(d) —Cases (Liability and Other Claims)..... 1015
§10:08 Insurer Reasonably Interprets Applicable Legal Precedent ... 1029
§10:09 —Cases 1032
§10:10 Insurer’s Reasonable Reliance Upon Independent Experts ... 1041
§10:11 —Cases 1043
§10:12 Claim Handled in a Reasonably Timely Manner 1054
§10:13(a) —Cases (Auto Claims)..... 1062
§10:13(b) —Cases (Property Claims) 1082
§10:13(c) —Cases (Life/Health/Disability Claims) 1093
§10:14 Possible Misrepresentation/Fraud by Insured 1098
§10:15 —Cases 1101
§10:16 Reasonable Handling of UM/UIM Claim 1114
§10:17 —Cases 1122
§10:18 Insurer Takes Reasonable Position Regarding Settlement 1160
§10:19 —Cases 1167
§10:20 Litigation Conduct Held As Not Indicative of Bad Faith 1193
§10:21(a) —Cases Involving Insurer Decision to Bring Litigation
Against Its Insured..... 1199
§10:21(b) —Cases Involving Conduct by Insurer or Counsel After
the Institution of Litigation 1204
§10:22 Releases 1231
§10:23 —Cases 1232
§10:24 Miscellaneous Allegations Held Not to Constitute
Bad Faith 1237
§10:25 —Cases 1241
§10:26 Commentary on Selected Bad Faith Topics 1252

**Chapter 11: Damages Recoverable: Attorneys’ Fees, Costs and
Interest 1285**
§11:01 Overview..... 1285

Table of Contents

§11:02 Cases Addressing Attorneys’ Fees..... 1291
§11:03 Cases Addressing Interest and Costs..... 1317
§11:04 Commentary..... 1326

Chapter 12: Damages Recoverable: Compensatory Damages..... 1331
§12:01 Overview..... 1331
§12:02 Cases..... 1335
§12:03 Commentary..... 1362

Chapter 13: Damages Recoverable: Punitive Damages..... 1369
§13:01 Overview..... 1369
§13:02 Pennsylvania Law of Punitive Damages 1371
§13:03 Is More Than Bad Faith Required for Imposition of
Punitive Damages?..... 1373
§13:04 Cases Discussing What Must Be Proven to Recover Punitive
Damages Under Pennsylvania’s Bad Faith Statute..... 1376
§13:05 Limits on Punitive Damages Awards 1386
§13:06 Pennsylvania Bad Faith Cases Discussing the Extent of
and Limits on Punitive Awards..... 1397
§13:07 Commentary..... 1424

Chapter 14: Discovery in Bad Faith Litigation..... 1433
§14:01 Overview..... 1434
§14:02 Production of the Insurer’s Claim File..... 1436
§14:03 —Cases..... 1437
§14:04 Attorney Communications and Work Product..... 1445
§14:05(a) —Cases, State Court 1455
§14:05(b) —Cases, Federal Court 1472
§14:06 Production of Claims Manuals and Educational Materials... 1492
§14:07 —Cases..... 1495
§14:08 Production of Underwriting Policies and Guidelines 1507
§14:09 —Cases..... 1508
§14:10 Insurer’s Handling of Other Unrelated Claims, Lawsuits,
or Policies 1510
§14:11 —Cases..... 1513
§14:12 Reserve Information 1526
§14:13 —Cases, Discovery of Reserve Information Permitted 1529
§14:14 —Cases, Discovery of Reserve Information Not Permitted... 1538
§14:15 Evaluation, Selection and Compensation of Insurer’s
Employees or Agents 1545
§14:16 —Cases..... 1548
§14:17 Corporate and Financial Information..... 1559
§14:18 —Cases..... 1560

INSURANCE BAD FAITH IN PENNSYLVANIA TOC-ix

Table of Contents

§14:19 Miscellaneous Discovery Topics	1568
§14:20 —Cases.....	1571
§14:21 Commentary.....	1586
Chapter 15: The Interaction Between §8371 and Other	
State and Federal Statutes	1609
§15:01 Overview.....	1609
§15:02 The Motor Vehicle Financial Responsibility Law	1610
§15:03 —Cases Involving Determination by Peer Review Organization That Medical Treatment is Not Reasonable and Necessary.....	1614
§15:04 —Cases Involving Other Allegations Concerning Requests for Medical Benefits.....	1621
§15:05 —Cases Involving Requests for Wage Loss Benefits.....	1631
§15:06 ERISA and Bad Faith	1633
§15:07 —Cases.....	1638
§15:08 Pennsylvania Workers’ Compensation Act and Bad Faith	1643
§15:09 —Cases.....	1645
§15:10 Other Federal and State Statutes and Bad Faith	1649
§15:11 —Cases.....	1649
§15:12 The UTPCPL and Bad Faith.....	1656
§15:13 —Cases.....	1659
Verdicts Appendix.....	1679
Table of Cases.....	1689
Index	1759
Selected Bibliography	1773